

# Screening for Appropriate Assessment of Ballyness Bay Aquaculture Licence Site T12/441C

ALAB Appeal Ref No. AP7/2025 (previously AP8/2020)

### Appeal description:

Appeal against the decision of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine to grant with variation an Aquaculture licence in November 2019, for the cultivation of pacific oysters using bags & trestles at Aquaculture Licence site T12/441C in Ballyness Bay, County Donegal.

#### Step 1 - Description of the project, purpose of this document and local site characteristics

#### Brief description of the project

Anthony McCafferty applied for an aquaculture licence for a 0.113-hectare site in Ballyness Bay for the cultivation of pacific oysters using bags and trestles in February 2010 (T12/441).

The Department's Marine Engineering Division (MED) determined on the 04 March 2010 that the site is positioned in the low water channel, and the substrate is of poor quality. Despite these limitations the MED concluded that there was no engineering reason to refuse or alter the site.

The minister decided to grant the applicant an aquaculture licence for a 0.113-hectare site (T12/441C) for the cultivation of pacific oysters using bags and trestles on 27 November 2020.

The proposed project involves installing low-profiles steel trestles (0.8 metres high) supporting mesh bags fixed by rubber straps or clips. Bags are turned and graded periodically and remain on site year-round for a period of 2 to 3 years.

The proposed access to the site is from Magheraroarty Pier and Ballyness Pier, using tractors and trailers.

The current draft aquaculture licence for Site T12/441C prepared by the Minister in November 2019 contains a number of conditions related to the use of tractors (or other vehicles) accessing, leaving and operating on site. In particular, that all vehicles must adhere to the strictly approved access and egress routes and that the licensees shall organise operations in consultation with other licensed operators to ensure that the total number of vehicles and harvesting machines on the foreshore on any one day is kept to the minimum necessary.

#### Brief description of the site characteristics

The proposed project is located in Ballyness Bay, which is situated in north-west Donegal adjacent to the towns of Gortahork and Falcarragh.

Ballyness Bay is a large and very shallow estuarine complex, with extensive areas of sandflats which are exposed at low tide. The Dooey Peninsula stretches across the mouth of this well-sheltered bay, leaving only a narrow strait to the open sea.

Site T12/441C is located in the eastern side of Ballyness Bay; the site lies within 50m of the High-water mark.

There are currently no licenced aquaculture sites in Ballyness Bay. Two previous aquaculture licenced sites were in operation in the 1990's, both for the cultivation of Pacific oysters using the bags and trestles, however the last of these licences lapsed in 1999.

The Bay is currently not a Designated Shellfish Area nor a Classified Bivalve Mollusc Production Area.

The proposed aquaculture licence site T12/441C is within the Ballyness Bay SAC and are 0.05 km from the Falcarragh to Meenlaragh SPA.

#### Purpose of this document

This report is the Screening for Appropriate Assessment for the proposed aquaculture licence site T12/441C and has been prepared in order to enable the Board to make a formal screening determination for the purposes of Regulation 42 of European Communities (Birds and Natural Habitats) Regulations 2011 as amended, and to confirm the European Sites which should be brought forward to a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment, prior to carrying out a public consultation under the 2011 Regulations.

## Step 2 - Identification of relevant Natura 2000 sites using Source-Pathway-Receptor Model and compilation of information on qualifying interests and conservation objectives.

The Qualifying Interests (QI's) highlighted in **bold text** are deemed to have a source-pathway-receptor link and as such the relevant European sites have been screened in. Distances are measured as straight-line distances in open water, or along-shore coastal distances, depending on the site and QI's being considered and are measured from the closest point of the proposed licence boundary that is the subject of this appeal. SPA Qualifying Interests are assessed based on behavioural characteristics and foraging range.

Table 1: List of protected sites and their Qualifying Interests

European Site Code	Distance from the Proposed Project (km)	List of Qualifying Interests	Site Specific Conservation Objectives (Maintain/Restore favourable conservation condition)	Connections (Source- Pathway-Receptor link)	Qualifying Interests considered further in Screening Y/N	European Site Screening in for stage 2 Appropriate Assessment
Ballyness Bay	0	Estuaries [1130] Embryonic shifting dunes [2110] Shifting dunes along the shoreline with Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120] Humid dune slacks [2190] Vertigo geyeri (Geyer's Whorl Snail) [1013]	Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain	No (no source-pathway- receptor link)	No (no source- pathway-receptor link)	
SAC (Site code 001090)		Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes) [2130]	Restore	No – project located 1,021m from 2130 Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes)	No	Yes

	Mudflats and sandflats not covered by seawater at low tide [1140]	Maintain	Yes – location of project overlaps with 1140 Mudflats and sandflats not covered by seawater at low tide	Yes – possible physical disturbance and habitat loss	
Gweedore Bay and Islands SAC (Site code 001141)	Coastal lagoons [1150] Reefs [1170] Perennial vegetation of stony banks [1220] Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and Baltic coasts [1230]¹ Atlantic salt meadows (Glauco- Puccinellietalia maritimae) [1330]² Mediterranean salt meadows (Juncetalia maritimi) [1410] Embryonic shifting dunes [2110] Shifting dunes along the shoreline with Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120] Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes) [2130] Decalcified fixed dunes with Empetrum nigrum [2140] Atlantic decalcified fixed dunes (Calluno- Ulicetea) [2150] Dunes with Salix repens ssp. argentea (Salicion arenariae) [2170] Humid dune slacks [2190] Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0]	Restore Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Restore Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Restore	No (no source-pathway- receptor link)	No	Yes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> No Site-Specific Conservation Objectives at time of writing and as such the habitat/species conservation objectives from the nearest applicable site has been used.

		Oligotrophic to mesotrophic standing waters with vegetation of the Littorelletea uniflorae and/or Isoeto-Nanojuncetea [3130] <sup>2</sup> European dry heaths [4030] Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Juniperus communis formations on heaths or calcareous grasslands [5130] Euphydryas aurinia (Marsh Fritillary) [1065] <sup>2</sup> Phocoena phocoena (Harbour Porpoise) [1351] <sup>2</sup>	Maintain Maintain Restore			
		Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395] Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]	Maintain Maintain			
		Najas fiexilis (Sieffder Nafau) [1655]	ividilitalli		Yes – possible	
		Lutra lutra (Otter) [1355]	Maintain	Yes – project within 1355 Otter foraging range	visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	
		Embryonic shifting dunes [2110] Shifting dunes along the shoreline with	Maintain			
		Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120] Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous	Maintain			
Horn Head and Rinclevan		vegetation (grey dunes) [2130] Dunes with Salix repens ssp. argentea	Maintain			
SAC (Site code	5.5	(Salicion arenariae) [2170]	Restore	No	No	
000147)		Humid dune slacks [2190]	Maintain	(No source-pathway-		
		Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0] Oligotrophic to mesotrophic standing	Restore	receptor link)		
		waters with vegetation of the Littorelletea				

	uniflorae and/or Isoeto-Nanoiuncetea				Yes
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Maintain			103
		Maintain			
		Maintain			
	Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]	Maintain			
			yes (Project located	Yes – possible	
	Halichoerus grynus (Grey Seal) [1364]				
	rianchiocras grypas (Grey Scar) [1304]	Maintain	out site. <sup>2</sup> )	noise disturbance	
	Oligotrophic waters containing very few				
	minerals of sandy plains (Littorelletalia				
	Water courses of plain to montane levels	Maintain			
		Maintain			
		iviaiiitaiii			
6.8		Restore			
	European dry heaths [4030]	Maintain	No		
	Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060]	Restore	(No source-pathway-	No	
	Molinia meadows on calcareous, peaty or		receptor link)		
	-				
	Blanket bogs (if active bog) [/130]	Restore			
	6.8	Halichoerus grypus (Grey Seal) [1364]  Oligotrophic waters containing very few minerals of sandy plains (Littorelletalia uniflorae) [3110]  Water courses of plain to montane levels with the Ranunculion fluitantis and Callitricho-Batrachion vegetation [3260]  Northern Atlantic wet heaths with Erica tetralix [4010]  European dry heaths [4030]  Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060]	[3130] Vertigo geyeri (Geyer's Whorl Snail) [1013] Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395] Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]  Halichoerus grypus (Grey Seal) [1364]  Maintain  Oligotrophic waters containing very few minerals of sandy plains (Littorelletalia uniflorae) [3110] Water courses of plain to montane levels with the Ranunculion fluitantis and Callitricho-Batrachion vegetation [3260] Northern Atlantic wet heaths with Erica tetralix [4010] European dry heaths [4030] Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Molinia meadows on calcareous, peaty or clayey-silt-laden soils (Molinion caeruleae) [6410]  Maintain  Maintain	[3130] Vertigo geyeri (Geyer's Whorl Snail) [1013] Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395] Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]  Halichoerus grypus (Grey Seal) [1364]  Oligotrophic waters containing very few minerals of sandy plains (Littorelletalia uniflorae) [3110] Water courses of plain to montane levels with the Ranunculion fluitantis and Callitricho-Batrachion vegetation [3260] Northern Atlantic wet heaths with Erica tetralix [4010] European dry heaths [4030] Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Molinia meadows on calcareous, peaty or clayey-silt-laden soils (Molinion caeruleae) [6410]  Maintain No Maintain No (No source-pathway-receptor link) Maintain	[3130] Vertigo geyeri (Geyer's Whorl Snail) [1013] Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395] Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]  Halichoerus grypus (Grey Seal) [1364]  Oligotrophic waters containing very few minerals of sandy plains (Littorelletalia uniflorae) [3110] Water courses of plain to montane levels with the Ranunculion fluitantis and Callitricho-Batrachion vegetation [3260] Northern Atlantic wet heaths with Erica tetralix [4010] European dry heaths [4030] Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Molinia meadows on calcareous, peaty or clayey-silt-laden soils (Molinion caeruleae) [6410]  Maintain No Hestore (Project located 557m from MI identified seal haul out site.²)  Wash above water noise disturbance Maintain Maintain Naintain No Maintain No (No source-pathway-receptor link) No (No source-pathway-receptor link)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Marine Institute's February 2019 report supporting Appropriate Assessment of Aquaculture in Ballyness Bay SAC concluded that in relation to interactions between aquaculture operations and seal use of the site [Ballyness Bay SAC], the risk of disturbance cannot be discounted and that based upon local observations it appears that seals are faithful to this one identified haul out location [identified sand bank in northwest of Bay]. The report further concluded that careful consideration should be given to licencing the site which shares the sandbank with the observed seal haul out. The DAFM Mitigation Summary subsequently states that "Proposed sites where there is proximity to seal sites will be reduced where possible or not licensed to maintain a buffer between the aquaculture sites and the seal areas." Licence decisions for affected sites were refused/granted with variations based on a 200m buffer zone around the identified seal haul out location.

		Depressions on peat substrates of the Rhynchosporion [7150] Old sessile oak woods with Ilex and	Restore Maintain			
		Blechnum in the British Isles [91A0]  Margaritifera margaritifera (Freshwater Pearl Mussel) [1029]	Restore			Yes
		Vandenboschia speciosa (Killarney Fern) [6985]	Maintain			
					Yes – possible visual disturbance & above water	
		Lutra lutra (Otter) [1355]	Maintain	Yes – project within 1355 Otter foraging range	noise disturbance  Yes – possible  physical	
		Salmo salar (Salmon) [1106]	Maintain	Yes – project within 1106 Atlantic Salmon migratory route	disturbance due to increased macroalgal levels along 1106 Atlantic Salmon migratory route	
Muckish Mountain SAC (site code 001179)	7.1	Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060] Siliceous rocky slopes with chasmophytic vegetation [8220]	Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Fawnboy Bog/Lough Nacung SAC (site code 000140)	8.4	Northern Atlantic wet heaths with Erica tetralix [4010] Blanket bogs (if active bog) [7130] Depressions on peat substrates of the Rhynchosporion [7150]	Restore Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No

		Margaritifera margaritifera (Freshwater Pearl Mussel) [1029]	Restore			
Tory Island SAC (site code: 002259)	11.3	Coastal lagoons [1150] Reefs [1170] Perennial vegetation of stony banks [1220] Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and Baltic coasts [1230] Submerged or partially submerged sea caves [8330] <sup>2</sup>	Restore Maintain Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Sessiagh Lough SAC (site code 000185)	12.4	Oligotrophic to mesotrophic standing waters with vegetation of the Littorelletea uniflorae and/or Isoeto-Nanojuncetea [3130] Najas flexilis (Slender Naiad) [1833]	Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Sheephaven SAC (site code 001190)	13.7	Mudflats and sandflats not covered by seawater at low tide [1140]  Annual vegetation of drift lines [1210] <sup>2</sup> Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and Baltic coasts [1230] <sup>2</sup> Salicornia and other annuals colonising mud and sand [1310] <sup>2</sup> Atlantic salt meadows (Glauco-Puccinellietalia maritimae) [1330]  Mediterranean salt meadows (Juncetalia maritimi) [1410]  Embryonic shifting dunes [2110] <sup>2</sup> Shifting dunes along the shoreline with Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120]  Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous vegetation (grey dunes) [2130]  Humid dune slacks [2190] <sup>2</sup> Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0]	Maintain  Restore  Maintain  Restore  Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No

		Old sessile oak woods with Ilex and Blechnum in the British Isles [91A0] Euphydryas aurinia (Marsh Fritillary) [1065] <sup>2</sup>	Maintain Maintain			
		Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395]				
		canopity name and (i.e.a.work) [1999]	Maintain			
		Mudflats and sandflats not covered by				
		seawater at low tide [1140]	Maintain			
		Annual vegetation of drift lines [1210]	Maintain			
		Perennial vegetation of stony banks [1220]	Maintain			
		Vegetated sea cliffs of the Atlantic and				
		Baltic coasts [1230]	Maintain			
		Embryonic shifting dunes [2110]	Maintain			
		Shifting dunes along the shoreline with				
Tranarossan		Ammophila arenaria (white dunes) [2120]	Maintain			
and Melmore		Fixed coastal dunes with herbaceous				
Lough SAC	18.0	vegetation (grey dunes) [2130]	Maintain			
(site code	16.0	Decalcified fixed dunes with Empetrum				
000194)		nigrum [2140]	Maintain	No		
000194)		Dunes with Salix repens ssp. argentea		(No source-pathway-	No	No
		(Salicion arenariae) [2170]	Maintain	receptor link)	INO	NO
		Humid dune slacks [2190]	Maintain	receptor link)		
		Machairs (in Ireland) [21A0]	Maintain			
		Hard oligo-mesotrophic waters with				
		benthic vegetation of Chara spp. [3140]	Maintain			
		European dry heaths [4030]	Maintain			
		Alpine and Boreal heaths [4060]	Maintain			
		Petalophyllum ralfsii (Petalwort) [1395]	Maintain			
Falcarragh to						
Meenlaragh	0.05	Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122]	Restore			No
SPA (site code	0.00	(5.5		No	No	
004149)						

				(No source-pathway- receptor link. Purely terrestrial species)		
Inishbofin, Inishdooey		Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122]	Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
and Inishbeg SPA (site code 004083)	3.1	Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182] Lesser Black-backed Gull (Larus fuscus) [A183] Arctic Tern (Sterna paradisaea) [A194]	Restore Restore Restore	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
Derryveagh and Glendowan Mountains SPA (site code 4039)	6.7	Merlin (Falco columbarius) [A098] Peregrine (Falco peregrinus) [A103]	Maintain Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
		Red-throated Diver (Gavia stellata) [A001] Golden Plover (Pluvialis apricaria) [A140] Dunlin (Calidris alpina schinzii) [A466]	Maintain Maintain Maintain	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
Horn Head to Fanad Head SPA (site code 09194)		Fulmar (Fulmarus glacialis) [A009] Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Kittiwake (Rissa tridactyla) [A188] Guillemot (Uria aalge) [A199] Razorbill (Alca torda) [A200] Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser	Restore Maintain Restore Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
	6.8	albifrons flavirostris) [A395] Peregrine (Falco peregrinus) [A103] Chough (Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax) [A346]  Cormorant (Phalacrocorax carbo) [A017]	Restore Maintain Restore Restore	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
		Shag (Phalacrocorax aristotelis) [A018]	Restore	Totaging ranges	noise distarbance	

Greers Isle SPA (site code 004082)	27.7	Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus ridibundus) [A179] Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182] Sandwich Tern (Thalasseus sandvicensis) [A863]	Restore Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Lough Fern SPA (site code 004060)	27.2	Pochard (Aythya ferina) [A059] Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Restore Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Tory island SPA (site code 004073)	13	Fulmar (Fulmarus glacialis) [A009] Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122] Razorbill (Alca torda) [A200] Puffin (Fratercula arctica) [A204]	Maintain Maintain Maintain Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Islands SPA (site code 04230)	11.8	Shag (Phalacrocorax aristotelis) [A018] Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182] Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Maintain Restore Maintain	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
West Donegal		Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Corncrake (Crex crex) [A122]	Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
West Donegal SPA (site code 04150)	10.8	Peregrine (Falco peregrinus) [A103] Chough (Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax) [A346]  Cormorant (Phalacrocorax carbo) [A017] Shag (Phalacrocorax aristotelis) [A018] Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Maintain Restore Restore Maintain Restore	receptor link)  Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
		Fulmar (Fulmarus glacialis) [A009] Kittiwake (Rissa tridactyla) [A188] Razorbill (Alca torda) [A200]	Restore Restore Restore	No (No source-pathway-	No	

Illancrone and Inishkeeragh SPA (site code 004132)	30.1	Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Common Tern (Sterna hirundo) [A193] <sup>3</sup> Arctic Tern (Sterna paradisaea) [A194] <sup>4</sup> Little Tern (Sterna albifrons) [A195] <sup>4</sup>	Restore Restore Restore Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Lough Swilly SPA (site code 004075)	33.3	Great Crested Grebe (Podiceps cristatus) [A005] Grey Heron (Ardea cinerea) [A028] Whooper Swan (Cygnus cygnus) [A038] Greylag Goose (Anser anser) [A043] Shelduck (Tadorna tadorna) [A048] Teal (Anas crecca) [A052] Mallard (Anas platyrhynchos) [A053] Scaup (Aythya marila) [A062] Goldeneye (Bucephala clangula) [A067] Red-breasted Merganser (Mergus serrator) [A069] Coot (Fulica atra) [A125] Oystercatcher (Haematopus ostralegus) [A130] Knot (Calidris canutus) [A143] Dunlin (Calidris alpina) [A149] Curlew (Numenius arquata) [A160] Redshank (Tringa totanus) [A162] Greenshank (Tringa nebularia) [A164] Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus ridibundus) [A179] <sup>4</sup> Common Tern (Sterna hirundo) [A193] <sup>4</sup>	Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The 22 March 2024 ALAB TA AA Supplementary Report (available on the ALAB website at 2024 03 22 ALAB AA report final.pdf) included four additional sites Illancrone & Inishkeeragh SPA, Roaninish SPA, Lough Swilly SPA and Lough Foyle SPA in an extended stage 1 screening for AA exercise. The four sites are included in the above screening table, and I concluded that three of the four sites are to be carried forward for stage 2 AA based on species behavioural characteristics and foraging range i.e. there is no SP-R link for a number of the species due to their behavioural characteristics/foraging ranges.

		Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser albifrons flavirostris) [A395]	Maintain			
		Wigeon (Mareca penelope) [A855]	Maintain			Yes
		Shoveler (Spatula clypeata) [A857]	Maintain			. 63
		Sandwich Tern (Thalasseus sandvicensis) [A863] <sup>4</sup>	Maintain			
		Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain			
		Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182]	Maintain	Yes – Project within this coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	
Inishkeel SPA (site code 004116)	37.5	Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045]	Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Roaninish SPA		Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045]	Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	
(site code 004121)	38.8	Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Restore	Yes – Project within this coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	Yes
Lough Nillan Bog SPA (site code 004110)	20.5	Merlin (Falco columbarius) [A098] Golden Plover (Pluvialis apricaria) [A140] Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser	Maintain Restore	No (No course nathway	No	No
	39.5	albifrons flavirostris) [A395] Dunlin (Calidris alpina schinzii) [A466]	Restore Restore	(No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No

Sheskinmore Lough SPA (site code 004090)	41.6	Greenland White-fronted Goose (Anser albifrons flavirostris) [A395]	Restore	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Trawbreaga Bay SPA (site code 004034)	50.7	Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis) [A045] Light-bellied Brent Goose (Branta bernicla hrota) [A046] Chough (Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax) [A346] Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Donegal Bay SPA (site code 004151)	52	Great Northern Diver (Gavia immer) [A003] Light-bellied Brent Goose (Branta bernicla hrota) [A046] Common Scoter (Melanitta nigra) [A065] Sanderling (Calidris alba) [A144] Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	No
Lough Foyle SPA (site code 004087)	53.9	Red-throated Diver (Gavia stellata) [A001] Great Crested Grebe (Podiceps cristatus) [A005] Bewick's Swan (Cygnus columbianus bewickii) [A037] Whooper Swan (Cygnus cygnus) [A038] Greylag Goose (Anser anser) [A043] Light-bellied Brent Goose (Branta bernicla hrota) [A046] Shelduck (Tadorna tadorna) [A048] Teal (Anas crecca) [A052] Mallard (Anas platyrhynchos) [A053] Eider (Somateria mollissima) [A063] Red-breasted Merganser (Mergus serrator) [A069]	Maintain	No (No source-pathway- receptor link)	No	

Oystercatcher (Haematopus ostralegus) [A130] Golden Plover (Pluvialis apricaria) [A140] Lapwing (Vanellus vanellus) [A142] Knot (Calidris canutus) [A143] Dunlin (Calidris alpina) [A149] Bar-tailed Godwit (Limosa lapponica) [A157] Curlew (Numenius arquata) [A160] Redshank (Tringa totanus) [A162]	Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain Maintain			Yes
Redshank (Tringa totanus) [A162] Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus				
ridibundus) [A179] Wigeon (Mareca penelope) [A855] Wetland and Waterbirds [A999]	Maintain Maintain			
Common Gull (Larus canus) [A182] Herring Gull (Larus argentatus) [A184]	Maintain Maintain	Yes – Project within these coastal species foraging ranges	Yes - possible visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance	

#### Step 3 Assessment of likely significant effects

Table 2: List of all potential direct and indirect impacts that may have an effect on the conservation objectives of a European site, taking into account the size and scale of the project.

Impacts	Possible Significance of Impacts (duration, magnitude etc.)
Physical disturbance and habitat loss	Possible direct impacts on 1140 Mudflats and sandflats not covered by seawater at low tide
Visual disturbance and above water noise disturbance	Possible indirect impacts on bird species identified in table 1
	Possible temporal indirect impacts on 1355 Otter
	Possible indirect impacts on 1364 Grey Seal
Physical disturbance	Possible indirect impacts on 1106 Atlantic Salmon

#### **In-Combination Effects**

Following a search of relevant databases undertaken on the 17 October 2025 and having regard to the European Commission's *Assessment of plans and projects in relation to Natura 2000 sites*<sup>4</sup> Guidance document, the below project(s) have been identified as potential incombination projects.

Table 3: List of potential in-combination projects

Application reference(s)	Project description	Distance to aquaculture licence site T12/441C (km)	Project status
T12/407B	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/407B in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.	0.67	Decision to grant issued by Minister
T12/409B (1&2)	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and trestles and cultivation of clams (Ruditapes philippinarum) on wooden trays under mesh on the inter- tidal/sub-tidal foreshore on site ref	0.59 (1) 0.5 (2)	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Assessment of plans and projects in relation to Natura 2000 sites – Methodological guidance on the provisions of Article 6(3) and (4) of the Habitats Directive 92/43/EEC 2021/C 437/01(Commission notice C/2021/6913. Dated 28.10.2021).

	T12/409B in Ballyness Bay, Co.			
	Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters (Crassostrea gigas) using bags and			
T12/441A	trestles on the foreshore on site ref	0.83	Decision to grant issued by	
112/4417	T12/441B in Ballyness Bay, Co.	0.03	Minister	
	Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters			
	(Crassostrea gigas) using bags and			
T12/441B	trestles on the foreshore on site ref	0.05	Decision to grant issued by	
,	T12/441B in Ballyness Bay, Co.		Minister	
	Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters			
	(Crassostrea gigas) using bags and		Desision to grant issued by	
T12/441C	trestles on the foreshore on site ref	0	Decision to grant issued by Minister	
	T12/441C in Ballyness Bay, Co.		wiiiistei	
	Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters			
	(Crassostrea gigas) using bags and		Decision to grant issued by	
T12/500A	trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on	0.65	Minister	
	site ref T12/500A in Ballyness Bay, Co.			
	Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters			
T12/F02A	(Crassostrea gigas) using bags and	0.00	Decision to grant issued by	
T12/502A	trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on	0.96	Minister	
	site ref T12/502A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters			
	(Crassostrea gigas) using bags and			
T12/514A	trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on	1.0	Decision to grant issued by	
, -	site ref T12/514A in Ballyness Bay, Co.	-	Minister	
	Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters			
	(Crassostrea gigas) using bags and		Decision to grant issued by	
T12/515A	trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on	0.65	Minister	
	site ref T12/515A in Ballyness Bay, Co.		Willister	
	Donegal.			
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters			
	(Crassostrea gigas) using bags and		Decision to grant issued by	
T12/516A	trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on	0.72	Minister	
	site ref T12/516A in Ballyness Bay, Co.			
T12/4004	Donegal.			
T12/409A	Cultivation of clams on wooden trays under mesh on the inter-tidal/sub-		Decision to grant with	
	tidal foreshore on site ref T12/409A in	1.1	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister	
	Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal		variation issued by willister	
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters using			
	bags and trestles on the foreshore on		Decision to grant with	
T12/455A	site ref T12/455A in Ballyness Bay, Co.	0.43	variation issued by Minister	
	Donegal		,	
	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters using			
T12/4550	bags and trestles on the foreshore on	0.00	Decision to grant with	
T12/455B	site ref T12/455B in Ballyness Bay, Co.	0.09	variation issued by Minister	
	Donegal			

T12/510A	Cultivation of Pacific Oysters using bags and trestles on the inter-tidal foreshore on site ref T12/510A in Ballyness Bay, Co. Donegal	1.23	Decision to grant with variation issued by Minister
----------	--	------	---

The following plans, related to the development of the maritime environment were also identified:

- The Climate Action Plan 2025
- River Basin Management Plans 2022-2027 (RBMP)
- Donegal County Development Plan 2024 2030
- National Biodiversity Action Plan 2023 2030

It cannot be excluded on the basis of objective scientific information that the proposed aquaculture project in combination with the above listed projects and plans, will have a significant effect on Ballyness Bay SAC, Gweedore Bay and Islands SAC, Horn Head and Rinclevan SAC, Cloghernagore Bog and Glenveagh National Park SAC, Inishbofin, Inishdooey and Inishbeg SPA, Derryveagh and Glendowan Mountains SPA, Horn Head to Fanad Head SPA, West Donegal SPA, West Donegal Islands SPA, Lough Swilly SPA, Roaninish SPA and Lough Foyle SPA particularly in relation to those projects which could potentially cause increased physical disturbance or habitat loss (such as other aquaculture licensed activities increasing the potential for habitat loss or increased organic material) and increased visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance.

Were mitigation measures considered during the screening process? No

#### **Step 4 Screening Determination Statement**

The assessment of significant effects:

Based on the information on file, and having regard to:

- The nature and scale of the proposed development
- The distance to the nearest European sites
- The potential for in-combination effects with other plans and projects
- Physical disturbance
- Physical disturbance and habitat loss
- Visual disturbance & above water noise disturbance

Having considered the legal framework applicable to Appropriate Assessment, it was concluded that the project the subject of the proposed Aquaculture Licence for the cultivation of pacific oysters on site T12/441C in Ballyness Bay, County Donegal will require Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment as it cannot be excluded on the basis of objective scientific information following screening that the proposed project, individually or in combination with other plans or projects, will have a significant effect on a European Site.

Conclusion			
	Tick as appropriate	Recommendation	
(i) The possibility of significant effects on a European site can be excluded			
(ii) The possibility of significant effects on a European site cannot be excluded	✓	Proceed to Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment	
Senior Technical Advisor Signature and Date			

Appendix 1:
T12/441C Aquaculture Licence Map

